

WISDOM PUBLICATIONS
199 Elm Street
Somerville, Massachusetts 02144

First published in 1987 in paperback under the title of
Thus Have I Heard: The Long Discourses of the Buddha

© Maurice Walshe, 1987, 1995
All rights reserved.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical,
including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system or technologies
now known or later developed, without permission in writing from the publisher.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Tipiṭaka. Suttapiṭaka. Dīghanikāya. English

The long discourses of the Buddha : a translation of the Dīga Nikāya / by
Maurice Walshe.

p. cm. — (Teachings of the Buddha)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-86171-103-3 (alk. paper)

I. Walshe, Maurice O'C. (Maurice O' Connell) II. Title. III. Series.
BQ1292.E53W35 1996

294.3'823—dc20

95-11288

ISBN 0-86171-103-3

14 13 12 11 10
12 11 10 09 08

Cover designed by: L.J.SAWLIT

Set in DPalatino 10 on 12.5 point

Wisdom Publications' books are printed on acid-free paper and meet the guidelines
for permanence and durability of the Committee on Production Guidelines
for Book Longevity of the Council on Library Resources.

Printed in Canada

that insight into the soullessness of each aggregate follows from a statement of the fact? [5-6] On what grounds can you defend the sequence in one case only out of the three sets of five propositions?

[7] Now do you mean to tell me that insight issues from every syllable of this formula:—This—is—pain—and—sor—row?¹

A.—Nay, that cannot truly be said.² . . .

5. Of the Force of the Magic Gift (Iddhi).

Controverted Point.—That one who has the gift of magic potency might live on for a *kappa* [on earth].

From the Commentary.—The interval, *kappa*, here means a ‘great’ cycle (*mahākappa*³), not its fourth part, the ‘incalculable cycle’ (*asankheyakappa*⁴), nor the mere ‘life-term’ (*ayukappa*). Now some, like the *Mahāsanghikas*, hold this view, because they have not thoroughly grasped the real advantage lying in the development of the steps to magic potency. The opponent, knowing that his vital principle or functioning is but the result of karma, has to deny that his vital functions are determined by *iddhi*. All that magic potency can effect is to avert things that would bring about an untimely death.

[1] *Th.*—But is his life-span, is his destiny, is his acquisition of individuality a thing of magic potency [that he should be able to prolong one interval of it]? For this is what you are herein affirming.

And do you reckon the *kappa* as past or as future?

[And why restrict yourself to one *kappa*?] Why not say ‘might live on for two, three, four *kappas*?’

[2] Again, do you mean that, given life, he could live on for the remainder of his life, or that he could live on

¹ *Dukkha* includes both. In PTS text read *du ti* for *ruci*.

² *Ibid.*, read, for *Āmantā*, *Na h'evag vattabbe-pe*.

³ See *Compendium*, 142, n. 1 (in which page, for [n.] 3 read 1, and 2nd fn. as 2). Cf. *Anguttara-Nik.*, ii. 126, 142. On *iddhi* see *Bud. Psychology*, 127, 161.

⁴ Cf. Childers' *Pali Dictionary*, *sub voce kappa*.

for the remainder of his life if there were no [organic] life left?

M.—He could live on for the remainder of his life, given life.

Th.—Then he could certainly not live on for a *kappa*.ⁱ

M.—[Well then] if there were no [organic] life left.

Th.—What! he could live on though dead, though deceased? . . .

[3] [Again, what could he effect by the magic gift in the duration of consciousness?] Could he by it succeed in preventing any phase of consciousness that had arisen from ceasing, contact, for instance, or feeling, or perception, or volition, and so on?

[4] Or could he by it make any one of the five aggregates (body-mind) permanent?

[5] Or could he by it prevent (a) beings liable to re-birth² from being born? Or (b) beings liable to grow old, from old age?³ Or (c) beings liable to disease, from disease,⁴ or (d) liable to die, from death? . . .

[6] M.—But was it not said by the Exalted One: ‘Ānanda, whosoever has cultivated, developed, established, built up, and persistently practised the four Steps to Iddhi, so as to be able to use them as a vehicle and as a basis, he, should he desire it, could remain in the same birth for a kappa, or for that portion of the kappa which had yet to run’?⁵

Does not this support my proposition?

ⁱ The normal duration of human life being at the most 100 years (*Sayyutta-Nik.*, ii. 94 f.).—*Comy.*

² Literally, having the quality or nature of birth.

³ In the *Netti* (p. 23) it is said that by i d d h i old age may be deferred, and youthfulness prolonged till death.

⁴ From this it may be inferred that Buddhists did not attach much importance to the therapeutic value of magic potency, or i d d h i.

⁵ *Dialogues*, ii. 110 f. The four Steps are will, effort, thought, investigation, each united to earnest thought and the struggle against evil. ‘Iddhi’ means accomplishment. Cf. *Milinda*, i. 198 f. (translation), where the question is again argued without reference to the *Kathāvatthu*. Whether *kappa* here meant āyukappa only or not, the Mahāsanghika takes it to mean mahākappa.

[7] *Th.*—But was it not also said by the Exalted One: ‘*O bhikkhus! against four things there is none that can be surely, be he recluse or brahmin, be he deva, or Māra, or Brahma, or anyone whatever in the world. Against which four? Against the old age of those subject to decay. Against the infirmities of those liable to infirmities. Against the dying of those whose nature it is to die. Against the coming to pass of the consequences of the evil deeds done in the past—deeds that were corrupt, tending to re-becoming, vain, of evil effect, making for birth, decay, and death?*’¹

Is the Suttanta thus?

Hence it is not right to say that one who has the gift of magic potency might live on for an æon.

6. Of Concentration.

Controverted Point.—That the continuity of consciousness² is concentration of mind (*samādhi*).³

From the Commentary.—Some, like the Sabbatthivādins and Uttarāpathakas, hold that, because of the Word—‘*to spend seven days and nights motionless, speechless, in the experience of absolute bliss*’—the flow of consciousness itself may constitute concentration. They do not take the latter term as meaning collectedness of thought, even when the coefficient of individualizing intentness (*ekaggata*) has arisen in a momentary unit of consciousness.

[1] *Th.*—Your statement must include of course past and future states of consciousness in the series. You forgot that, and you must agree that the past having ceased and the future being unborn, it is not right to say that they form a [present] concentrated state of mind.⁴

¹ *Anguttara-Nik.*, ii. 172.

² *Citta-santati*. See *Compendium*, 6, 153, n. 1; 157, n. 4; 252 f.

³ *Samādhi* means the placing, establishing of consciousness exclusively and voluntarily on any single object. *Ekaggata* is the essential factor in consciousness, the cultivation of which may bring about the state called *Samādhi*.

⁴ There is no use in speaking of a ‘state’ without a ‘function’ of mind. And only the present state can be functioning (*paccuppannam eva cittag kicca karay hoti*).—*Comy.*

Pali Text Society

TRANSLATION SERIES, NO. 28

THE
DEBATES COMMENTARY
(*Kathāvatthupakarana-Atthakathā*)

Translated into English for the first time
by

BIMALA CHURN LAW, Ph.D., M.A., B.L.

*Author of A History of Pali Literature, Some Kshatriya Tribes of Ancient India,
Geography of Early Buddhism, etc., etc.*

PALI TEXT SOCIETY

OXFORD

1999

IV

Now follows the controversy about the utterance of the word, 'This is Ill!'

Some, for instance the Andhakas hold, that the devotee,¹ at the moment when he enters on the Way, utters the word: 'This is Ill!' and from the utterance of the word: 'This is Ill!' insight into the nature of Ill is set working.² It is with regard to them that the Sakavādin asks. The opponent assents with reference to both utterance of such word and issuing of insight. But inasmuch as he admits, that the average man utters also the word concerning the remaining (three) Truths, but no such result ensues on the utterance of them, therefore, in the questions: "Does it follow therefrom?" and so forth he denies.

"Is the material shape impermanent?" and so forth have been asked by way of showing the procedure of 'Ill.' But the opponent denies, because he does not see any such mode of speech in his own doctrine.³

"And do you mean that this?" and so forth is asked in order to show the opponent that, if insight issues from Ill, there must be four kinds of insight successively issuing from every syllable of the formula:—'This—is—sor-row?' The opponent, however, denies because he does not wish it (to be taken) thus.

The controversy about the utterance of the word:
'This is Ill!' is ended.

V

[131] Now follows the controversy about psychic power (*iddhi*).⁴

Some, for instance the Mahāsaṅghikas, not thoroughly

¹ *Yogāvacara*: an early use of this term in Pali records.—Ed.

² See above, IX, i; cf. II, v, vi.

³ If 'own doctrine' refers to an older stratum of Buddhism, this clause is remarkable.—Ed.

⁴ *Iddhi*, lit. effectuating = what we might now call psychic power.—Ed.

grasping 'the real advantage lying in the development of the steps to psychic power,' hold the view that 'one who has the gift of psychic power might live on for a cycle¹ (on earth).' Regarding them the Sakavādin asks: "Could he who has the gift of psychic power, live on for a cycle (on earth)?"

Therein this interval (*kappa*) is of three kinds: (1) a great cycle, (2) a portion of the cycle, and (3) a life-time. In the expression, "*These are, monks, the four incalculables in a cycle,*"² a great cycle is meant. In the expression, "*A cycle of the Brahmā-devas extends up to their life-time,*"³ a portion of a cycle is meant. In the expression, "*For a cycle he undergoes suffering in hell, for another he rejoices in heaven,*" a life-span is meant. What is meant here is, that the life given in a life-span may be ended either as the result of *karma*, or by counting the years. Of these the Sakavādin asks, with reference to a 'great cycle,' and the opponent assents.

Then the Sakavādin asks him: "Is the life-span a thing of psychic power?" and so forth, in order to urge on the opponent, that if one has (the gift of) psychic power, he might live on for a great cycle or a portion thereof, which is more than the measured duration of human life (according to the passage: "*He who lives for a long time, lives at the most 100 years*");⁴ and thus his life must be a thing of psychic power. The opponent, knowing the vital functioning is but the result of *karma*, denies that vital functioning is determined by psychic power.

"But what is here the distinction of one who has psychic power? Is it not the distinction that even one who has not this power might live on for a cycle?" One who has this power, can, by it, in the duration of his life, avert things that would bring about an untimely death. One without psychic power cannot so avert. This is the distinction between them.

"Is it past or future?" is asked in order to urge on the opponent, who admits that such a person might live on indiscriminately for a cycle. "For two cycles?" and so forth is asked in order to urge that, if one who has psychic power could live on at the end of his life, he could do so not

¹ *Kappa*; *Dialogues* ii, 110 f.

² *Ibid.*, 128.

³ *Anguttara* ii, 142.

⁴ *Samy.* ii, 94.

only for one cycle but also for many cycles. "Contact that had arisen" and so forth is said in order to show, that not all things [132] are attainable by psychic power; there are things not included within the sphere of *iddhi*.

The rest here is clear in meaning.

The controversy about the psychic power is ended.

VI

Now follows the controversy about concentration.

Because of the word—'to spend seven days and nights motionless, speechless, in the experience of absolute bliss'¹—some, for instance the Sabbatthivādins and Uttarāpathakas hold, that the continuity of consciousness² itself may constitute concentration. They do not take 'concentration' as meaning collectedness of thought, even when the coefficient of individualizing intentness² has arisen in a momentary unit of consciousness.³ Regarding them the Sakavādin asks and the opponent assents.

Then to urge on the opponent thus: "If the continuity of consciousness is concentration of mind, it must include also past and future states of consciousness. And only a present state cannot constitute concentration. Do all these also constitute concentration?"—"Does it include past?" and so forth is asked. The opponent denies, because he would not like it.

To show that in the continuity of consciousness only the present state can be functioning and there is no use of speaking of the past having ceased and the future being unborn; how can these be called concentration of mind?—"Is not the past ceased?" and so forth is asked.

"Is concentration confined to a momentary conscious unit?" is asked by the opponent. The Sakavādin assents with reference to the statement in his own doctrine, namely,⁴

¹ *Majjhima-Nikāya* i, 94.

² *Ekaggata*, lit. one-peaked-ness. See, for translation, *P. of C.*, p. 260.

³ *Cittasantati*.

⁴ *Samyutta* iii, 13; v, 414.

MILINDA'S QUESTIONS

VOLUME I

TRANSLATED FROM THE PALI BY

I. B. HORNER, M.A.

(*Translator of "Book of the Discipline", and
"Middle Length Sayings"*)

LONDON

LUZAC & COMPANY, LTD.
46 GREAT RUSSELL STREET, W.C.1

1969

[First Division 10: The Three Months' (Time-)Limit]

"Revered Nāgasena, this too was said by the Lord: 'Ānanda, the Tathāgata's four bases of psychic power³ have been developed, increased, made a vehicle, made a

¹ *vihāraphāsu*, which of course must be different in meaning from *phāsuvihāra*, abiding in comfort, a term probably having at least a semi-technical sense; see *BD.* iv. 118, 373, where *phāsuvihāra* appears to be connected with a monk's receiving proper guidance, *nissaya*, from a senior. Above, *vihāraphāsu* means I think nothing more concrete or technical than the mental and spiritual comfort to be derived from meditation in solitude.

² *vīhi* is a term that means series or course, process; street, way.

³ *iddhipādā*. The four are those possessed of concentration of intention, of concentration of energy, of concentration of consciousness and of concentration of investigation. Frequent in the Nikāyas, e.g., at *D.* ii. 77, *M.* i. 103, *S.* v. 263 ff., *A.* i. 39. See also *Vbh.* 216 ff., *VbhA.* 303 ff., *Vism.* 385.

ground, maintained, consolidated, and well undertaken. Ānanda, if the Tathāgata so desired he might remain for his (full) life-span or for what is left of it.¹ And again, it was said: 'Three months from now the Tathāgata will attain complete nibbāna.'² If, revered sir, it was said by the Lord: 'Ānanda, the Tathāgata's four bases of psychic power have been . . . well undertaken. Ānanda, if the Tathāgata so desired he might remain for his (full) life-span or for what is left of it,' well then false is the (time-)limit to three months. If it was said by the Tathāgata: 'Three months from now [141] the Tathāgata will attain complete nibbāna,' well then, false is that statement which says: 'Ānanda, the Tathāgata's four bases of psychic power have been . . . well undertaken. Ānanda, if the Tathāgata so desired he might remain for his (full) life-span or for what is left of it.' There is no thundering of Tathāgatas about what is (causally) impossible.³ The words of the Buddhas,

¹ D. ii. 103, S. v. 259, Ud. 62, and cf. Kvu. 45. *Kappa* is taken by DA. 554, SA. iii. 251, UdA. 323, BudvA. 65 as here meaning life-span, *āyukappa*, the stated hundred years as the extreme age to which a man might live, and not as *mahākappa*, an eon. The Elder Mahāsiva was not satisfied with this explanation: he held that the Buddha meant to live out this *bhaddakappa* (see BudvA. 191: this *kappa* itself in which five Buddhas have arisen) but could not do so because his body was subject to the laws of old age. Cf. below, text p. 151: "there is no expedient for maintaining a life-span that is wearing to its close." For contra however see above, Miln. 139, "solitary meditation increases the life-span." For an interesting dissertation on the recognition by the Sthaviravādins, Sarvāstivādins and Mahāsanghikas of the difficulties involved in the theory of the Buddha extending his *āyu*, life-span, see P. S. Jaini, *Buddha's Prolongation of Life*, BSOAS, xxi. 3, 1958, p. 546 ff.; also see Pts. Contr., pp. 258 f.

BHSD, against PED and CPD, holds that *kappāvasesa* means "more than a kalpa," but gives no reasons for preferring this to "what is left of a kappa."

² D. ii. 119, S. v. 262, Ud. 64. According to DA. 556, SA. iii. 253, UdA. 327 the Lord did not let go of the components of his life-span like a ball of clay from his hand, but for exactly three months he entered upon the attainment of the fruits, thinking, "I will not enter upon them for longer than that."

³ These words are ascribed to Mahāsivatthera at DA. 554, SA. iii. 251, but reading Buddhānam for Miln's Tathāgatānam.

siesta.' 'Very good, Lord', said Ānanda, and, getting a mat, he followed behind.

3.2. Then the Lord came to the Cāpāla Shrine, and sat down on the prepared seat. Ānanda saluted the Lord and sat down to one side, and the Lord said: 'Ānanda, Vesālī is delightful, the Udena Shrine is delightful, the Gotamaka Shrine is delightful, the Sattambaka³⁹⁷ Shrine is delightful, the Bahuputta³⁹⁸ Shrine is delightful, the Cāpāla Shrine is delightful. [103]

3.3. 'Ānanda, whoever has developed the four roads to power,³⁹⁹ practised them frequently, made them his vehicle, made them his base, established them, become familiar with them and properly undertaken them, could undoubtedly live for a century,⁴⁰⁰ or the remainder of one. The Tathāgata has developed these powers,... properly undertaken them. And he could, Ānanda, undoubtedly live for a century, or the remainder of one.'

3.4. But the Venerable Ānanda, failing to grasp this broad hint, this clear sign, did not beg the Lord: 'Lord, may the Blessed Lord stay for a century, may the Well-Farer stay for a century for the benefit and happiness of the multitude, out of compassion for the world, for the benefit and happiness of devas and humans', so much was his mind possessed by Māra.⁴⁰¹

3.5. And a second time..., and a third time... (as verses 3-4). [104]

3.6. Then the Lord said: 'Ānanda, go now and do what seems fitting to you.' 'Very good, Lord', said Ānanda and, rising from his seat, he saluted the Lord, passed by on the right and sat down under a tree some distance away.

3.7. Soon after Ānanda had left, Māra the Evil One came to the Lord, stood to one side, and said: 'Lord, may the Blessed Lord now attain final Nibbāna, may the Well-Farer now attain final Nibbāna. Now is the time for the Blessed Lord's final Nibbāna. Because the Blessed Lord has said this: "Evil One, I will not take final Nibbāna till I have monks and disciples who are accomplished, trained, skilled, learned, knowers of the Dhamma, trained in conformity with the Dhamma, correctly trained and walking in the path of the Dhamma, who will pass on what they have gained from their Teacher, teach

the Lords, are not foolish, their words are true, their words do not admit of contradiction. This too is a double-pronged question, profound, very abstruse, hard to understand; it is put to you; burst asunder this net of false views, set it to one side, burst asunder the tenets of others."

"Sire, this was said by the Lord: 'Ānanda, the Tathāgata's four bases of psychic power have been . . . well undertaken. Ānanda, if the Tathāgata so desired he might remain for his (full) life-span or for what is left of it.' And the three months' (time-)limit was spoken of. But *kappa* (here) means the full life-span.¹ Sire, the Lord was not proclaiming his own power when he spoke thus: 'Ānanda, the Tathāgata's four bases of psychic power have been . . . well undertaken. Ānanda, if the Tathāgata so desired he might remain for his (full) life-span or for what is left of it.' When he spoke thus, sire, the Lord was proclaiming the potency of psychic power. As, sire, a king's thoroughbred horse might be as swift as the speed of wind and the king, in declaring its power and speed to (leading) townsfolk and countryfolk, to the employees, the palace-guard, brahmans, householders, ministers and in the midst of people, might speak thus: 'When he desires it, good sirs, this wonderful horse of mine, though roaming the earth as far as it is bounded by the waters of the oceans, could come back here in a moment,² and though he would not show his speed to that assembly, yet his speed exists, and in a moment he is (again) able to roam the earth as far as it is bounded by the waters of the oceans. Even so, sire, when the Lord was proclaiming his own potency of psychic power he spoke thus; and when he was seated in the midst of devas and men, of arahants who had the threefold knowledge and the six super-knowledges, stainless and their cankers destroyed, he said: 'Ānanda, the Tathā-

¹ *so ca pana kappa āyukappa vuccati*; see above, p. 196, n. 1. Though the word *āyukappa* is not among the meanings into which *kappa* is analysed at *MA*. ii. 125, it again has the meaning of life-span at *DA*. 103. The word also occurs at *DhA*. i. 250.

² Cf. the Horse-Treasure at *D*. ii. 174, *M*. iii. 174.

gata's four bases of psychic power have been . . . well undertaken. Ānanda, if the Tathāgata so desired he might remain for his (full) life-span or for what is left of it.' And, sire, that potency of pyschic power of the Lord's exists and by his potency of psychic power the Lord was able to remain for his (full) life-span or for what was left of it. But the Lord did not [142] show that potency of psychic power to that assembly. As far as all becomings are concerned, sire, the Lord was without desire, and all becomings were condemned by the Tathāgata.¹ And this too was said by the Lord, sire: 'As, monks, even a trifling quantity of dung is evil-smelling, so do I not, monks, praise becoming even for a trifling time, not even for the lasting of a finger-snap.'² Furthermore, sire, would the Lord, who had seen in all becomings, bourns and modes of birth a resemblance to dung, harbour desire for and attachment to becomings with the support of the potency of psychic power ?'

"O no, revered sir."

"Well then, sire, it was when the Lord was proclaiming the potency of psychic power that he roared the lion's roar of a Buddha such as was this."

"It is good, revered Nāgasena; thus it is, therefore do I accept it."

[Second Division 1: The Abolition of the Rules of Training]

"Revered Nāgasena, this too was said by the Lord: 'I teach Dhamma, monks, from super-knowledge, not from what is not super-knowledge.'³ And again he spoke thus of the regulating of the Vinaya: 'After my passing, Ānanda, let the Order if it so desire abolish the lesser and minor rules of training.'⁴ Now, revered

¹ Cf. M. i. 410 f. Three becomings are mentioned at M. i. 50, S. ii. 3, A. i. 232, etc. At S. ii. 117, A. v. 9 it is said that the stopping of becomings is nibbāna.

² A. i. 34.

³ A. i. 276; cf. M. ii. 9, Kvu. 561, Māvu. iii. 51.

⁴ D. ii. 154. At Vin. ii. 287 the Lord is reputed to have told Ānanda that the Order might abolish them (*samūkhaneyya*, as against the imperative above and at D. ii. 154). Vin. ii. 287 gives the

THE
MINOR ANTHOLOGIES
OF THE PALI CANON

PART II
UDĀNA: VERSES OF UPLIFT
AND
ITIVUTTAKA: AS IT WAS SAID

TRANSLATED BY
F.L. WOODWARD, M.A.

WITH AN INTRODUCTION BY
MRS RHYS DAVIDS, D.LITT., M.A.

Published by
THE PALI TEXT SOCIETY
Oxford
2003

*With wandering wits the wiseacres range all the field of talk;
With mouths agape to full extent, what leads them on they know not.¹*

X

Thus have I heard: On a certain occasion the Exalted One was staying near Sāvatthī . . . in Anāthapindika's Park.

Now on that occasion the venerable Cūlapanthaka² was seated not far from the Exalted One in cross-legged posture, holding his body upright, with mindfulness set up in front of him. And the Exalted One, seeing him so doing, at that time, seeing the meaning of it, gave utterance to this verse of uplift:

*With mind and body firmly set,
Standing, seated or lying down,
If a monk should set up mindfulness,
He'd win the prize in first and last.³
And he, thus winning excellence,
Beyond the Death King's sight would go.*

CHAPTER VI.—JACCANDHA⁴

i

[62] THUS have I heard: On a certain occasion the Exalted One was staying near Vesālī in Great Wood, at the House of the Peaked Roof.⁵

¹ The verses are at *Vin.* i, 349, and *JA.* iii, 428 (*Kosambi-J.*) in a number spoken concerning quarrels in the order, evidently of a late date, and embodying also the well-known couplets from *Dhp. akkocchi may, avadhi may*, etc.

² Ranked *etad agga*, at *A.* i, 24, of those skilled in creating shapes of themselves and 'in mental evolution.' Cf. *Thag.* v. 557-66; *Brehren eq.*; *DhpA.* i, 239; *JA.* i, 4; *Vin. Pāc.* 22.

³ *Pubbāpariyat visesay*, 'what goes before and comes after': acc. to *Comy.* 'calm followed by insight.'

⁴ The name (*jāti + tya-andha*, 'blind from birth') derives from § 4 of this chapter.

⁵ At *D.* ii, 102= *Dialog.* ii, 110; *S.* v, 259= *K.S.* v, 230 (where see notes); *A.* iv, 308.

Now the Exalted One, robing himself in the forenoon and taking bowl and robe, entered Vesālī to quest for alms. After going his rounds in Vesālī, returning and eating his meal, he called to the venerable Ānanda, saying, ‘Ānanda, take a mat. I will go to Cāpāla Shrine for the noonday rest.’

‘Very well, sir,’ said the venerable Ānanda in reply to the Exalted One, and taking a mat he followed in the footsteps of the Exalted One.

Now when the Exalted One reached Cāpāla Shrine, he sat down on the seat made ready. And the venerable Ānanda, saluting the Exalted One, sat down at one side. As he thus sat, the Exalted One said this to the venerable Ānanda: ‘Delightful, Ānanda, is Vesālī! Delightful are the Shrine of Udena and the Gotamaka Shrine.¹ Delightful is the Shrine of Seven Mangoes, the Shrine of Many Sons, of Sārandada! Delightful is Cāpāla Shrine!

Whosoever, Ānanda, has made to become, made much of, applied himself to, made a basis of, stood upon, increased and fully undertaken the four bases of psychic power,—such an one, if he so wished, might remain (on earth) for his full span of life,² or for what is left of it.

Now, Ānanda, the Wayfarer has made to become . . . fully undertaken the four bases of psychic power, and if he chooses he can remain for his full span of life or for what is left of it.’

Then, although so broad a hint was dropped by the Exalted One, though so clear and plain was his meaning, yet could not the venerable Ānanda penetrate his meaning. So he begged not the Exalted One, ‘Sir, let the Exalted One remain for the full span of life. Let the Wellfarer remain for the rest of his span of life, for the profit of many folk, for the happiness of many folk, out of compassion for the world, for the welfare and profit

¹ Ascribed by *Comy.* to a *yakkha* of that name, G.S. i, 275; but probably it was the name of a forgotten sect of early followers. Cf. *Gotama the Man*, p. 193.

² Supposed by some to mean ‘the æon or world-period.’

and happiness of devas and mankind,' so far was his mind misguided by Māra.

[63] Then a second time the Exalted One said to the venerable Ānanda: 'Delightful is Vesālī, Ānanda! . . . Whosoever has made to become . . . the four bases of psychic power . . . might remain on earth for his full span of life. . . . The Wayfarer . . . if he chooses can remain for his full span of life or for what is left of it.' And a second time the venerable Ānanda (failed to grasp his meaning).

Then a third time also the Exalted One repeated his words . . . and a third time the venerable Ānanda (failed to grasp his meaning), so far was he misguided by Māra.

Thereupon the Exalted One said to the venerable Ānanda, 'Go, Ānanda! Do that for which you deem it the proper time.'¹

'Very well, sir,' replied the venerable Ānanda to the Exalted One, and rising from his seat he saluted the Exalted One with his right side and went away and sat down at the root of a tree not far off.

Now Māra, the Evil One, not long after the venerable Ānanda had gone, came to the Exalted One, and on coming to him said this:

'Now let the Exalted One pass away! Now let the Wellfarer pass away! Now, sir, is the time for the passing of the Exalted One!' Thus was it spoken, sir, by the Exalted One: "O Evil One, I shall not pass away till my monks are disciples trained, disciplined and confident, having won peace from the yoke,² who have heard much, who know dhamma by heart, who fare on in accordance with dhamma, who fare on dutifully, living according to dhamma, taking what they have learned from their own teacher,³ till they shall

¹ The usual polite form of dismissal, but *Comy.* takes it to mean 'go away for noonday rest.'

² Not in *D.* In my note at *K.S. v.*, I wrongly stated that it does not occur in *Udāna*. *D.* has *visāradā bahussutā*; *S.* and *A.* *visāradā pattayogakkhemā*; *Ud.* *visāradapattā yogak*.

³ *Sakay ācariyakan uggahetvā*, 'having themselves learned the doctrine' (*R. D.* in *Dialog. loc. cit.*). At *K.S. v*, 232 I corrected my

be able to proclaim, teach, show forth, establish, open up, analyze and make it plain; till they be able to refute any wrong view arising which may well be refuted by right reasoning,¹ and shall teach dhamma that brings salvation with it.

And now, sir, the Exalted One's disciples are indeed . . . able to proclaim and teach dhamma that brings salvation with it. Now, therefore, sir, let the Exalted One pass away! Let the Wellfarer pass away! Now is the time, sir, for the passing away of the Exalted One! For thus was it spoken by the Exalted One (*and he repeated the Master's words, as before, adding on each occasion 'nuns,' 'lay-followers, both male and female'*). [64] Moreover this was the saying of the Exalted One: "O Evil One, I shall not pass away utterly until this Brahma-living of mine be powerful and prosperous, widespread and widely known, made popular, proclaimed abroad by devas and mankind."² And now indeed, sir, this Brahma-living of the Exalted One is powerful and prosperous. . . . Therefore, sir, let the Exalted One pass utterly away! Let the Wellfarer pass utterly away! Now is the time for the utter passing away of the Exalted One!"

At these words the Exalted One thus replied to Māra, the Evil One: 'Trouble not thyself, O Evil One! In no long time shall be the utter passing away of the Wayfarer. At the end of three months from now the Wayfarer shall pass utterly away.'

Thereupon the Exalted One at Cāpāla Shrine, mindful and self-possessed, rejected his life's aggregate. And when the Exalted One had rejected his life's aggregate there was a mighty earthquake, and a fearful hair-raising thunder burst from the sky. And seeing the

version to 'taking it as their own teacher'; but I think both are wrong if the word is an adjective. *Comy.* here has *attano ācariyavāday*, 'shall cause others to take up in the way they themselves have taken it up.' So also *DA.* ii, 556 = *SA.* iii (*ad loc.*).

¹ *Saha-dhammena.* *Comy.* *sa-hetukena sa-kāraṇena vacanena.*

² Reading *yāva deva-man-* for the usual *yāva-d-eva m.* See my note at *KS.* v.

meaning of it, at that time the Exalted One gave utterance to this verse of uplift:

*That which had come to be, both gross and fine,¹
Becoming's compound did the sage reject.*

*With inward calm, composed, he burst asunder,
Like shell of armour, the self that had become.²*

ii

Thus have I heard: On a certain occasion³ the Exalted One was staying near Sāvatthī, in East Park, at the storeyed house of Migāra's mother. [65] Now on that occasion the Exalted One at eventide, having risen from his solitude, was sitting outside the porch (of the house). Then came the Rājah Pasenadi, the Kosalan, to visit the Exalted One, and on coming to him he saluted the Exalted One and sat down at one side. On that occasion also there passed by not far from the Exalted One seven long-haired ascetics, seven Nigaṇṭhas,⁴ seven naked ascetics, seven of those who wore one cloth only and seven Wanderers with long nails and hairy armpits, carrying a bundle on a shoulder-pole.⁵

Now when the Kosalan, the Rājah Pasenadi, saw these sevens, he rose from his seat and, putting his robe over one shoulder and dropping his right knee to the ground, raised his joined palms towards those sevens and thrice pronounced his own name, thus: 'Sirs, I am the Rājah Pasenadi, the Kosalan !'

¹ *Tulam atulam* (measurable and immeasurable), acc. to Comy. the physical and psychic. Comy. also suggests that *tulay* may be participial = *tulento*, and paraphrases as 'weighing together *nibbāna* (*atulay*) and becoming'; also that *bhava-sankhāray* = actions going to becoming. (The *Ang. sutta* is followed by an explanation of the earthquake, a later addition.) Netti, p. 61, quotes the verses and comments thus: *tulay* = *sankhāra-dhātu*; *atulay* = *nibbāna-dhātu*.

² *Atta-sambhava*, taken by Comy. as 'passions born in himself(?)'. I take it as meaning the cognizable personality with its constituents.

³ Cf. S. i, 77 = K.S. i, 104, with different *gāthās*.

⁴ Jains, with a white waist-cloth.

⁵ *Khāri-vividha* (*vivadha*), a three-bushel measure and shoulder-stick (in which their property was carried). Comy. takes it (*vividha*) as *nāna-pakāra* = *vidha*. Cf. D.A. i, 269; S.A. i, 148.

THE
UDĀNA COMMENTARY

(*Parmathadīpanī nāma Udānatthakathā*)

by
DHAMMAPĀLA

Translated from the Pāli
by
PETER MASEFIELD

VOLUME II

Published by
THE PALI TEXT SOCIETY
Oxford
2003

*cetiyam*¹⁵): the site where the yakkha named Cāpāla [323] had formerly dwelled, which had become well known as the “Cāpāla Shrine”, the vihāra (subsequently) built thereon for the Lord also being called, by extension, the “Cāpāla Shrine”. This same is also the method with respect to those (phrases) commencing “The Udena Shrine” and so on. *Sattamba* (*Sattambam*): they speak of that place at which, so it is said, the seven princesses of the daughter of Kiki, king of Kāsi, put forth effort after they had emerged, filled with shock, from the royal household¹⁶, as the “Sattamba Shrine”. The “Bahuputta” was some banyan tree with an abundance (*bahu*) of new shoots; an abundance (*bahū*) of humans used to pray for sons (*putte*) to the devatā resident therein, owing to which that place became well known as the “Bahuputta Shrine”¹⁷. The “Sārandada”¹⁸ was the site where the yakkha named Sārandada¹⁹ had dwelled. Hence all these were, without exception, designated as “shrines” (*cetiya*), on account of the fact that they had, previous to the arising of the Buddha, been possessed by devatās²⁰; whilst the vihāras built (at such places) for the Lord came to be similarly nicknamed²¹. *Delightful* (*ramanīyā*²²): in this connection, the delightful nature of Vesāli is, firstly, to be understood to be due to the excellence of that part of the world, to the excellence of its people, and to the fact that the requisites were gained with ease (there); whilst the delightfulness of its vihāras is to be regarded as being due to their having been neither too far from, nor too close to, the city, to the excellence of the journey to and from (the city), to the fact of their having been places offering an uncrowded stay (*vihāra*), to the excellence of their shade and water, and to their having offered suitable seclusion. *The four potency-bases* (*cattāro iddhipāda*): in this connection, the meaning of the word “potency”²³ (*iddhi*) is the same as that already stated above²⁴. *Has cultivated* (*bhāvitā*): has developed. *Frequently performed them* (*bahulikatā*): repeatedly performed them. *Made them a vehicle*²⁵ (*yānikatā*): made them similar to a vehicle that has been harnessed²⁶. *Made them a basis* (*vattiukatā*): made them similar to a basis in the sense of a foundation²⁷. *Manipulated them* (*anuṭṭhitā*): resolved they be (such and such) (*adhitthitā*). *Built them up all around him*

time he would have consented. Therefore, Ānanda, yours is the fault, yours is the failure.

3.41. 'Once, Ānanda, I was staying at Rājagaha, at the Vultures' Peak. And there I said: [116] "Ānanda, Rājagaha is delightful, the Vultures' Peak is delightful. Whoever has developed the four roads to power... could undoubtedly live for a century..." (as verse 3). But you, Ānanda, in spite of such a broad hint did not understand and did not beg the Tathāgata to stay for a century...

3.42. 'Once I was staying at Rājagaha in the Banyan Park..., at Robbers' Cliff..., at the Satapāṇī Cave on the side of Mount Vebhāra..., at the Black Rock on the slope of Mount Isigili..., at the slope by the Snakes' Pool in Cool Wood..., at the Tapodā Park..., at the Squirrels' Feeding-Ground in Veluvana..., in Jīvaka's mango-grove..., and also at Rājagaha in the Maddakucchi deer-park.

3.43. 'At all these places I said to you: "Ānanda, this place is delightful..." [117]

3.44. "'Whoever has developed the four roads to power... could undoubtedly live for a century...' (as verse 3).

3.45. 'Once I was at Vesālī at the Udena Shrine... [118]

3.46. 'Once I was at Vesālī at the Gotamaka Shrine..., at the Sattambaka Shrine..., at the Bahuputta Shrine..., at the Sārandada Shrine...

3.47. 'And now today at the Cāpāla Shrine I said: "These places are delightful. Ānanda, whoever has developed the four roads to power... could undoubtedly live for a century, or the remainder of one. The Tathāgata has developed these powers... and he could, Ānanda, undoubtedly live for a century, or the remainder of one."

'But you, Ānanda, failing to grasp this broad hint, this clear sign, did not beg the Tathāgata to stay for a century. If, Ānanda, you had begged him, the Tathāgata would twice have refused you, but the third time he would have consented.

~~3.48. Ānanda, have I not told you before: All those things~~
 that are dear and pleasant to us must suffer change, separation and alteration? So how could this be possible? Whatever is born, become, compounded, is liable to decay – that it should

(*paricita*): built them up (*cita*) them on all sides (*samantato*)²⁸, fully developed them. *Fully undertaken them: susamāraddhā=suṇhu samāraddhā* (resolution of compound), accomplished²⁹ them extremely thoroughly. Having thus talked (of such things) without reference (to a given individual), he once more says "The Tathāgata" and so on, indicating³⁰ (such things) referring (to a given individual). And in this connection, "for the kalpa" (*kappam*) is for the kalpa (in the sense of) a lifespan (*āyukappam*). *Could remain (tithayya):* could remain, could continue to live, completing³¹ whatever is the measure of lifespan for humans at such times³². *Or for what remains after the kalpa*³³ (*kappavasesam vā*): or for that exceeding a hundred years spoken of as "(for a hundred years) or slightly more"³⁴ (D ii 4; S i 108). The elder Mahāsīva, however, said: "There is, indeed, no trumpeting³⁵ on the part of Buddhas concerning that which cannot take place³⁶. For just as he had for ten months suppressed the sensation that had arisen in the hamlet of Beluva and that was to prove fatal³⁷, so could he, in suppressing same³⁸ by repeatedly attaining that³⁹ attainment, have remained for this entire auspicious kalpa⁴⁰". [324] So why didn't he remain? (Since) that spoken of as his clung-to (kamma-generated) body⁴¹ had been overcome⁴² by (the ravages of) broken teeth and so on⁴³; and (since)⁴⁴ Buddhas, moreover, attain parinibbāna in the fifth⁴⁵ phase of their lifespan, at a time when they are still dear and charming to the manyfolk, before they have reached a condition in which they have broken teeth and so on. (For) once the chief sāvakas⁴⁶ and the great sāvakas, who had become enlightened through the Buddha⁴⁷, had attained parinibbāna, he would have remained on all alone⁴⁸, without a retinue, or else with a retinue consisting (only) of child novices, whereupon he would have invited scorn such as "Oh dear me! Is this the assembly of the Buddhas?" Therefore he didn't remain. Yet even when such be said, it cannot be approved of⁴⁹; (for) this alone, viz. "a kalpa (in the sense of) a lifespan", is the definitive position of the Commentary.

A gross sign⁵⁰ (*olārike nimitte*): that which bluntly causes a perception to arise; for this blunt means of giving rise to a perception had the aim of having him beg⁵¹ him to stay on for

the entire kalpa⁵², saying "Let the Lord remain for the kalpa"—that is to say, it was an allegorical⁵³ explanation of his own capability of staying on for the kalpa, as a result of the majesty associated with his own cultivation of the four potency-bases, by way of (the statement) commencing "Anyone, Ānanda, who has cultivated the four potency-bases". Show (*obhāse*⁵⁴): public statement; and this statement, being public, was a quite straightforward explanation of his expectation, dispensing with (such⁵⁵) roundabout (talk)⁵⁶. For⁵⁷ the well-being of the manyfolk (*bahujanahitāya*): for the sake of the people's well-being. For the happiness of the manyfolk (*bahujanasukhāya*): for the sake of the people's⁵⁸ happiness. Out of pity for the world (*lokānukampāya*): through⁵⁹ pity for the world of beings. For which particular world of beings? For that one⁶⁰ which, upon hearing the Lord's Dhamma-teaching, penetrates {Dhamma}⁶¹, drinks the Deathless-drink⁶². For⁶³ eighteen koṭis of Brahmās, with Aññākondañña⁶⁴ at their head, penetrated Dhamma during the Lord's teaching of the Dhammacakkappavattanasutta⁶⁵—and so it was up until his guidance of the wanderer Subhadda⁶⁶, there being no counting of the beings who (during that interval) penetrated Dhamma, there being no limit to the beings who reached penetration at the time of his teaching these four suttas⁶⁷, viz. the Mahāsamayasutta (D ii 253ff), the Maṅgalasutta (Khp 2f = Sn p 46f), the Cūla-Rāhulovādasutta (M iii 277ff) and the Samacittasutta (A i 64f), such staying (on in *samsāra*) on the part of the Lord having come about⁶⁸ out of pity for this world of beings that is without measure. He⁶⁹ speaks with the implication that so will it be also in times yet to come. Of devas and men (*devamanussānam*): not just of devas and men alone; (for such) staying (on in *samsāra*) on the part of the Lord was for the benefit, for the well-being, for the happiness, of the remainder too, such as nāgas and supaṇṇas and so on. It was, however, stated thus so as to indicate those persons with relinking (consciousness) that possesses the roots⁷⁰ capable of realising the paths and their fruitions, meaning therefore "Let the Lord remain also for the sake of the others' benefit, for the sake of their well-being, for the sake of their happiness". Herein: for the

benefit (aladhāya): for the sake of excellence in this world. [325] **For the well-being (hīdāya):** for the sake of the well-being that constitutes the root-cause of excellence in the next world. **For the happiness (sukhādāya):** for the sake of that happiness consisting of the nibbāna-element. The former inclusion of well-being and happiness is, however, to be understood by way of that common to all. As⁷¹ with one whose heart is blocked by Māra (*yathā tam Mārena pariyuṭṭhitacitto*): in this connection, *tam* (untranslated) is a mere particle. The meaning is that just as any other puthujjana, whose heart is blocked, whose heart is engulfed, by Māra, would also have been unable to penetrate same, so was he himself unable to penetrate same. For Māra blocks the heart of the one for whom any of the perversions have yet to be abandoned; whereas nothing whatsoever need be said of the one for whom all twelve perversions⁷² have yet to be abandoned. But for the elder, four perversions⁷³ had yet to be abandoned, as a result of which he blocked his heart. But what does he do when blocking a heart? He causes beings to see a sight-object, or to hear a sound object, that is terrifying⁷⁴, whereupon, upon seeing same, or hearing same, they relinquish mindfulness and become open-mouthed. He then causes his hand to enter them via their mouth and kneads their heart, whereupon they persist in perceiving things wrongly⁷⁵. But how did he become able to cause his hand to enter the elder via his mouth? By causing him to see a terrifying object, upon seeing which the elder failed to penetrate that sign and show. (But) with what aim did the Lord, being fully aware of this, address him even up to a third time? With the aim of diminishing his grief by putting the blame on him saying "Yours alone is this wrong doing; yours alone this offence" when, later on⁷⁶, begged by him saying "Let the Lord remain, Lord". For the Lord beheld that "This one's heart is extremely affectionate towards me; later on, he will, upon hearing of the reason for the earthquake⁷⁷ and the spurning of my lifespan's formations, beg me to remain for a long time. Then I will have to lay the blame on his head alone, saying 'Why didn't you beg me earlier?'; and (since) beings are not smitten in the same way when the guilt (involved) is their own, his grief will thereby become diminished"^{78"79}.

simply "children", but the birth of a son, rather than a daughter, has always been more important in India.

18 Cp DA 521.

19 Reading Sārandadassa nāma with Be Se for text's Ce Sārandadanāma.

20 Reading devatāpariggahitattā with Be Se for text's Ce devatāpariggahitānī ti.

21 Reading sañjānanti with Se for text's paññātan ti, Ce paññātāni, Be paññāyanti.

22 So Be Se Ud for text's Ce ramaṇīyāni.

23 Reading iddhipādapadassa with Ce Be Se for text's iddhipādassa.

24 Ud-a 304.

25 Cp Pts i 172f for a rather different account of some of these terms; I have, wherever possible, tried to follow their elaboration at Sv-pṭ ii 191.

26 Meaning, presumably, ready for departure; cp Miln 276 which speaks of mounting the vehicle of potency in order to reach the city of nibbāna.

27 Reading patiṭṭhaṭṭhena with Be Se DA AA Sv-pṭ ii 191 for text's SA patiṭṭhānaṭṭhena, Ce patiṭṭhānam eva; cp Ud-a 305 above where patiṭṭhā forms part of Dhammapāla's explanation of iddhipāda. This qualification is no doubt given, since vatthu (basis) can have several other meanings.

28 Quasi-etymology: paricitā < samantato (= pari) + citā.

29 Pts i 173 offers a quite different analysis.

30 Ce Be AA read dassetum, so as to indicate (such things), for text's Se DA SA dassento.

31 Paripuṇṇam katvā tiṭṭheyā; DA SA AA paripuṇṇam karonto tiṭṭheyā. The PTS editions of DA and SA wrongly print tiṭṭheyā as part of the following lemma.

32 Cp D iii 68ff, which states that this may vary between 10 and 80,000 years, although, according to D ii 3f, none of the last seven Buddhas has lived at a time when this was less than a hundred years.

33 The cty would here seem to support the view expressed by BHSD, sv kalpāvaśeṣam, that this term means "more than a

kalpa", rather than "for the rest of the kappa", as stated by PED, sv *kappāvasesaṃ*, and CPD, sv *avasesa*. This view is criticised by Miss Horner at MQ i 196, on the grounds that Edgerton "gives no reasons for preferring this (interpretation)", though it may be noted that he cites in his support DA 554, which reads much the same as here. For a discussion, see Padmanabh S. Jaini, "Buddha's prolongation of life" in *BSOAS*, Vol 21, 1958, pp 546-552; also Kvū xi 5 and Miln 140ff. However, as Jaini notes, the suggestion that "kappa" here denotes a normal lifespan is difficult to accept, when it be remembered that Ānanda was severely censured at the First Council (Vin ii 289) for failing to beg the Lord to remain for the kalpa (and not, it may be noted, for more than the kalpa). For, given the fact that the Buddha had at this point, at the age of eighty, already been suppressing a fatal illness for ten months (cp notes at Ud-a 330 and 401), and was to continue to do so for a further three months, it could well be argued that he not only *did* remain for his normal lifespan (since he would ordinarily have died at Beluva) but also remained for thirteen months *more* than that lifespan. Finally, it ought not be lost sight of that the ability in question is attributed to *anyone* who has cultivated the potency-bases, not just Tathāgatas, most of whom, we may suppose, remain for a full lifespan.

³⁴ Reading *appam vā bhiyyo* with Se D S DA SA AA for text's Ce Be *appam vā bhiyyo vā*; cp DA 413 and SA i 175 which both state that one living for more than a hundred years does not live for a further hundred years, but only for an additional thirty, forty, fifty or sixty years.

³⁵ As of elephants; cp Ud-a 149 above.

³⁶ Atṭhāne; cp Ud-a 299 above. The same statement also recurs at Ud-a 401 below.

³⁷ Cp note at Ud-a 330 below.

³⁸ Text Ce Se DA SA add *dasamāse*, for ten months, here; Be AA omit.

³⁹ Reading *tam* with Ce Be Se DA SA for text's *vā*.

⁴⁰ That is, the present kalpa, which is auspicious in the sense that it will see the appearance of five Buddhas, with Gotama as fourth and Metteyya, still to come.

41 Upādinnakasarīram; cp MR&I 63 n 51; Ppn 494 n 23.

42 Reading abhibhuyyati with Ce Be Se DA SA AA for text's abhibhuyyā ti.

43 An allusion to the definition of old age at M i 49: "Whatever is old age, decrepitude, broken teeth, greying hair, wrinkly skin, the dwindling of the lifespan, the collapse of the (sense-)organs, is called old age" (MLS i 61).

44 Reading ca pana with Ce Be for text's pana, Se DA AA ca, SA nāma.

45 Reading pañcame with Ce Be Se DA SAAA for text's pacchime; cp Ud-a 278 above.

46 Who, as mentioned above, had already done so.

47 Buddhānu buddhesu; or perhaps who had become enlightened subsequent to/in succession to the Buddha—cp MR&I 196 n 31 and Thag-a on Thag 679, 1246 (quoted EV i 223) respectively. Cp Ud-a 412 for similar.

48 Other cities add "like a tree-stump".

49 All sources collapse into confusion at this point. DA reads so pana: Ruccati āyu kappo ti, ida eva, SA so pana 'na ruccati āyu-kappo' ti; idam eva, AA yo pana vuccati: āyukappo ti, idam eva for text's Ce so pana vuccati āyukappo ti. Idam eva, Se so pana vuccati āyukappo ti idam eva, Be so pana na ruccati | 'āyukappo' ti idam eva (similar variants also being found at Sv-pt ii 192). Be also adds a note recording amongst others a reading of so pana ruccati which it attributes to source "Ka" and the Burmese editions of DA and SA, adding piṭthesu pana passitabbam. The problem is compounded by the fact that it is not at all clear where the statement attributed to Mahāsīva is meant to finish. Ce and Be close the quotation immediately before "So why didn't he remain?", text and DA immediately before "Yet even when such be said", SA opening the quotation but failing to close it, and AA Se not employing quotation marks at all. I follow Ce and Be, treating what follows to be an objection on the part of Dhammapāla—though, given all the variables, other interpretations are no doubt possible. It may be noted that the reference to "Ap-a 10,17" in CPD sv āyukappa, which might have thrown more light on the issue, is spurious. The whole issue is,

of course, a matter of considerable doctrinal importance.

⁵⁰ Ud-a continues alone; other cities rejoin later.

⁵¹ Reading °yācanāya with Be for text's Ce Se °yācanā.

⁵² Text Ce add tiṭṭhatu; Be omits (which I follow).

⁵³ Reading aññāpadesena with Ce Be Se for text's aññapadesena; not listed by PED.

⁵⁴ Literally "glow", "illumination", etc., but according to CPD sv, a hint; cp Vibh 352f, quoted Vism 23, where nimitta and obhāsa (taken by U. Thiṭṭila as "sign" and "hinting talk", and by Nāṇamoli as "sign" and "indication") both form, together with parikathā (roundabout talk), part of the definition of nemittikatā (thus implying they were understood to be roughly synonymous); also the discussion at B Disc iv 355 n 3. But here Dhammapāla quite clearly takes the "gross sign" (nimitta) to refer to the Buddha's general statement concerning anyone who has mastered the potency-bases, itself understood as a hint, and the "gross show" (obhāsa) to refer to his specific statement concerning his own mastery thereof, which same he equates below with a public statement.

⁵⁵ So Sv-pṭ ii 192, which seems to equate this with the previous statement.

⁵⁶ Reading obhāse ti pākaṭavacane | pākaṭañ ca etam vacanam pariyyam with Be for text's obhāseti pākaṭavacane. Pakatañ h' etam vacanapariyyam, Ce obhāseti pākaṭavacane. Pākaṭam h' etam vacanapariyyam, Se obhāse ti pākaṭam h' etam vacanam yadidam pariyyam.

⁵⁷ Cp AA i 100f for similar; also MA i 123.

⁵⁸ Reading mahājanassa with Ce Be Se for text's bahujanassa.

⁵⁹ Paṭicca.

⁶⁰ Reading | tassa || Bhagavato with Ce Be Se for text's tassa Bhagavato.

⁶¹ Be omits.

⁶² Amatapānañ; the draught of immortality. It should not be forgotten that amṛtam had hitherto been a drink, equated with the Soma juice, which conferred immortality on the one partaking of it, thus rendering him immune to Death (and, in this context, thus to Māra, the King of Death).

63 The following five suttas, together with the Parābhavasuttanta (Sn 91ff) are also mentioned, in a slightly different order, in the same context at Miln 20; whilst Bv-a 292 also refers to the Dhammacakkappavattanasutta, Maṅgalasutta and Cūja-Rāhulovādasutta as the first, second and third penetrations (abhisamaya) respectively. More elaborate lists of conversions are also to be found at AA i 100f and Miln 349ff.

64 Be Aññātakoṇḍañña.

65 Vin i 10ff = S v 420ff.

66 Cp Vv-a 165 for similar; the Buddha's mission commenced with the conversion of Koṇḍañña (Vin i 11f) and concluded with his conversion of Subhadda (D ii 153), the mission which Māra asserts a little later in Ud is now complete. The Buddha, however, realising that only Subhadda had yet to be converted, therefore agreed to attain parinibbāna three months later, following the conversion of Subhadda.

67 Reading imesam catunnam suttanam desanākale abhisamayappattasattanam paricchedo n' atthi with Ce Be Se; text omits.

68 Reading jātam with Ce Be Se for text's hoti.

69 Ānanda, as narrator of the sutta in Ud, with reference to Metteyya, not the Buddha Gotama who, save for converting Subhadda, has done all he had to do.

70 Sahetukapaṭisandhike; cp Ud-a 292 above.

71 Other cities rejoin at this point.

72 The four perversions (vipallāsā) of perception, thought and view consist in each case of regarding that which is impermanent as permanent, that which is dukkha as not dukkha, that which is not-self as self, and that which is foul as lovely—cp A ii 52; Vism 683, etc.

73 According to Sv-pṭ ii 192, those of perception and heart, in either case in the form of regarding that which is foul as lovely and that which is dukkha as happiness.

74 Bheravam—so Be DA AA for text's Ce Se SA bherava°; cp Ud-a 68 above.

75 Visaññino; also at A ii 52, cited above, in connection with the perversions, AA iii 91 explaining as viparītasaññā.

⁷⁶ An allusion to D ii 115 where the Buddha, having finally been begged to stay on, points out that although he would have ignored the first and second of Ānanda's requests, he would have granted such a request if made a third time.

⁷⁷ Woodward's observation at VofU 78 n 1 that "the Ang. sutta is followed by an explanation of the earthquake, a later addition" ignores the fact that the same explanation is also to be found in the Dīgha account.

⁷⁸ Cp Sv-pt ii 192f for similar. The implication seems to be that people are troubled less by a situation when they themselves are responsible for it; and that Ānanda would have been troubled all the more had he thought someone else were responsible for the cosmic blunder of not begging the Lord to remain. This seems rather odd psychology from a tradition otherwise noted for the subtleties of its psychological insights.

⁷⁹ Woodward's note that this paragraph is Dhammapāla's and the next Buddhaghosa's is quite wrong. Most of the present paragraph is common to all cty's; whilst the one that follows is exclusive to Ud-a.

⁸⁰ DA SA add that he also goes by the names of Kanha, Antaka, Namuci and Pamattabandhu.

⁸¹ Cp D ii 112f.

⁸² Cp Ud-a 211 above.

⁸³ Reading kim te lokavicaranena with Ce Be (SA kim vo lokavicaranena) for text's kim vo lokaviharanāya, Se kim te lokaviharanāya (?) "What point is there in your staying in the world ?". DA reads kim vo lokavicāranena, AA kim te lokavicāranena, both meaning "What point is there in your exploring (= investigating) the world ?".

⁸⁴ Reading pan' esā with Ce Be DA SA AA and Ud for text's Se pana.

⁸⁵ Kilesavinayanena; cp Guide 37 where the same term is rendered "Outguiding of defilements". Sv-pt ii 193 explains as maggavasena kilesānam samucchchedavinayanena, by means of the guiding away, in the form of extirpation, of the defilements by way of the path.

⁸⁶ Probably an allusion to the samyojanas.

Pali Text Society

THE BUDDHA'S LAST DAYS

Buddhaghosa's Commentary
on the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta

Translated by

Yang-Gyu An

Published by

The Pali Text Society
Oxford

2005

applies to them.

3. Developed (*bhāvitā*) means increased. **Made much of** (*bahulikatā*): made again and again. **Made a vehicle** (*yānikatā*): made like a yoked carriage (*yutta-yānam*). **Made a foundation of** (*vattukatā*): made like a foundation (*vatthu*) in the sense of basis. **Carried out** (*anuttīthitā*): practised (*adhitthitā*). **Accumulated** (*paricitā*): heaped up (*citā*), well increased on all sides (*samantato*). **Well undertaken** (*susamāraddhā*): undertaken (*samāraddhā*) well (*sutthu*).¹

Having thus spoken in general and then pointing out² by explaining in particular,³ he began to say: **By the Tathāgata indeed.** In the text, **an æon** (*kappam*) means lifespan (*āyu-kappam*).⁴ One would remain (*tīttheyya*), completing whatever is the lifespan of human beings at a given time.⁵ **Or for the rest of the æon** (*kappāvasesam vā*): or a little more, i.e. over the stated hundred years.⁶

However, Mahāsīva Thera⁷ said, “There is no trumpeting of the

¹ Patis I 172f. gives a rather different explanation of some of these words. Cf. Sv-pt II 191.

² Read *niyametvā* for *niyāmetvā* (RFG).

³ This means: first he referred to anyone, then he applied it to himself (RFG).

⁴ One living more than a hundred years does not live for a further hundred years, but only for an additional thirty, forty, fifty, or sixty years (AN IV 138, Sv II 413, Spk I 175). Disregarding the *antarakappa*, there are two types: one is a *mahākappa* (“cosmic æon”), the other an *āyu-kappa* (normal maximum potential lifespan of a human being, namely one hundred years). Although Buddhaghosa takes *kappa* in the main text as the second, the understanding of the first is correct in the context. On this topic, see Gethin, pp. 95ff.; UC, p. 905, n. 33; Jaini, pp. 546–52; Kv XI 5; Mil 140ff. See my Introduction, pp. 1ff.

⁵ The length may vary from 10 to 80,000 years (DN III 68ff.); see the length of life of the last seven Buddhas at DN II 3ff.

⁶ Although Buddhaghosa interprets *kappāvasesa* as “a little bit more than a *kappa* (‘a human lifespan’)”, it is more likely to mean the remainder of a *kappa* (“a cosmic æon”). For a discussion, see my Introduction, p. 7.

⁷ There are two Mahāsīva Theras: one is Gāmantapabbhāravāsī-Mahāsīva thera who lived in the reign of King Dutthagāmaṇī Abhaya (161–137 b.c.), and the other is Dīghabhaṇaka-Tipiṭaka-Mahāsīvatthera, who was sometimes called

Buddha about what is not possible (*aṭṭhāne*);¹ just as for ten months he suppressed the deadly pain which occurred in the village of Beluva, so he could continue to live on² for this entire Good Kalpa (*bhaddakappa*)³ by realizing that attainment and suppressing the pain for ten months [555] again and again. But why did he not stay alive? A material body (*upādinnaka-sarīram*)⁴ is overcome by such things as the breaking of the teeth.⁵ Buddhas, do not reach that stage, but enter parinibbāna in the fifth part of life (*pañcama āyu-kotthāse*),⁶ at the very time which is pleasant for most people. When the great disciples who had become enlightened through the Buddha⁷ have entered parinibbāna, he would have to stay, like a solitary stump, or with a retinue of young novices. Then he would incur derision: ‘Alas, is this the assembly of the Buddha?’ Therefore the Buddha did not stay alive.” Although he

Dīghabhāṇaka-Mahāśivathera, Tipiṭaka Mahāśivathera, or just Mahāśivathera without a title, and who lived during King Vasabha (A.D. 65–109) (Sodo, p. 124). The second may be quoted here. Although Buddhaghosa quotes him with respect in many cases, sometimes he prefers the Aṭṭhakathā view to that of Mahāśiva Thera (Sv II 543, As 266).

¹ It may mean that the Buddha says only the truth; whatever he says is absolutely true (cf. Mil 141). The same sentence occurs at Ud-a 401. For the meaning of *aṭṭhāna*, see Ud-a 299. “The Buddha does not utter empty boasts” (RFG).

² SS and Ud-a 324.1 add *ti* after *tittheyya*.

³ This is the name of the æon in which we are now living. This æon is one of five *asuññakappas* (during which one or more Buddhas are born). In an auspicious æon five Buddhas are born (Bv-a 191, Sv II 411).

⁴ This is a synonym for *upādinnaka-rūpa* (“clung-to matter”) and *kammaja-rūpa* (“kamma-born matter”). Here it can mean “material body that was clung to”, which suggests a shade of contempt for the body. For references, see Dhs 653; Nāṇamoli, p. 494, n. 23.

⁵ MN I 49 gives the signs of old age: greying hair, wrinkly skin, the dwindling of the lifespan, the collapse of the sense organs.

⁶ Ud-a 324.3 reads *pacchime* (“last”) for *pañcama*. The figure seems to mean 80–100, when a human lifespan is counted as 100 years.

⁷ Delete one of the *ca*’s; cf. UC, p. 906, n. 47.

claimed so, here lifespan (*āyu-kappa*) is meant.¹ This² term “lifespan” (*āyu-kappa*) is expounded³ in the *Atthakathā*.⁴

4.⁵ As (*yathā tam*) his mind was possessed by Māra: Here *tam* is a mere indeclinable particle. It means that just as any ordinary unenlightened person, if his mind is possessed, encompassed, by Māra, could not comprehend,⁶ so he could not comprehend. Māra possesses the mind of any person whose twelve perversions (*vipallāsa*)⁷ have not been given up completely. The elder had not given up four perversions⁸ and so Māra possessed his mind. But what does Māra do when he possesses one’s mind? He either shows a frightening visible form or makes a fearful sound. Then people, on seeing it or hearing it, forget themselves and open their mouths. He then inserts his hand through the mouth and kneads the heart. Then will he be able to insert his hand

¹Each edition reads this sentence differently; Spk III 252.3 reads *Evaṁ vutte pi so pana* “*na ruccati āyu-kappo*” *ti*; Mp IV 149.22 reads *Evaṁ vutte pi yo pana vuccati*: *āyukappo ti*; Ud-a 324.8-9 reads *Evaṁ vutte pi so pana vuccati āyu-kappo ti* for *Evaṁ vutte pi so pana*: *Ruccati āyukappo ti* in our text. The difference depends on where the quotation from Mahāsīva ends (UC, p. 906, n. 49). I translate it according to Ud-a.

²Emend *ida* to *idam* (Ud-a 324.9).

³Read *niyamitam* for *niyāmitam*.

⁴The text *atthakathā* (in the singular form) in Sv denotes the Sinhalese *Dīghanikāya-atthakathā* (Adikaram, p. 14). Its view may be based on Kv XI 5 and Mil 140ff., which state that no one, not even an arahant, can live more than his *āyu-kappa*, refuting the Mahāsamghika view of *mahā-kappa* as an arahant’s lifespan. See my Introduction, p. 5.

⁵Put the number 4 according to the main text.

⁶On occasion Māra possessed Vēṭambari and made him utter heretical doctrines (SN I 67, cf. Dhp-a IV 141). For other occasions of Māra’s activity of possessing, see SN I 114; MN I 326ff., 334ff., 336ff.

⁷The four perversions may be either of perception (*saññā*), consciousness (*citta*) or view (*dīpti*). The four perversions are to regard; (1) what is impermanent as permanent, (2) what is painful as happy, (3) what is without a self as a self, (4) what is impure as pure. Cf. AN II 52, Vism 683, etc.

⁸Those of perception and consciousness, in either case in the form of regarding what is impure as pure and what is painful as happy (Sv-pt II 192.12-14).

through the elder's mouth?¹ He showed him a frightening sight. Having seen it, the elder did not comprehend the clear suggestion. Even though he knew this, why did the Blessed One address him up to three times? In order to lessen his sorrow by putting the blame on him, saying, "This is your misdeed, this is your fault",² when, later on,³ he was asked by the elder: "Sir, let the Blessed One live on."⁴

3.2. Commentary on the Episode of Māra's Request

7. Māra, the Evil One (Pāpimā): Māra is so defined in that he kills (*māreti*) by inciting people to harm. The Evil One is a synonym for Māra. Māra is called the Evil One because he is endowed with an evil (*pāpa*) nature. His other names include Kaṇha (the Dark One), Antaka (Terminator), Namuci ("one who gives no escape"), Pamatta-bandhu ("a kinsman of indulgence").⁵ **These words once were spoken:** For Māra

¹ According to some Chinese versions of MPS, Māra entered into the stomach of the elder. Once Māra entered Moggallāna's stomach and caused severe discomfort (MN I 332).

² Ānanda's fault which resulted from Māra's possession, was employed in MPS to explain away, in the process of the development of the Buddhological conception, the Buddha's inability to live on, despite all his powers (Freedman, pp. 390–98). It is interesting to note that Ānanda did not consider his action as an offence of wrong-doing when he was accused of the above offence at the First Council (Vin II 288).

³ See DN II 115 which records Ānanda's request and the Buddha's refusing of it.

⁴ Ud-a 325 continues: "For the Blessed One understands 'This one has extremely affectionate heart towards me. He will, later on, on hearing of the causes of an earthquake and my abandoning of a life-impetus, ask me to live on for a long time. Then I will put the blame on his head by saying 'Why did you not ask me before?' Human beings are not so troubled with their own faults. Therefore his sorrow will be allayed.'" On those sentences, Peter Masefield comments: "The implication seems to be that people are troubled less by a situation when they themselves are responsible for it; and that Ānanda would have been troubled all the more had he thought someone else were responsible for the cosmic blunder of not begging the Lord to remain" (UC 909, n. 78). His first comment is correct, but the second goes too far.

⁵ The explanation of each of them is given at Sv-pt II 193.8–12.

Pali Text Society

Points of Controversy
OR
Subjects of Discourse

BEING
A TRANSLATION OF THE
KATHĀ - VATTHU
FROM THE
ABHIDHAMMA-PITAKA

BY
SHWE ZAN AUNG, B.A.
AND
MRS. RHYS DAVIDS, M.A.

"And he said, Open the window eastward. And he opened it."
Book of the Kings, II. xiii. 17.

London
PUBLISHED FOR THE PALI TEXT SOCIETY
BY
MESSRS. LUZAC & COMPANY, LTD.
46 GREAT RUSSELL STREET, W.C.1
1960